

Brown University  
*Program in Judaic Studies*

**Zionism, Anti-Zionism and Post-Zionism: Israel - Past, Present, Future**  
JUDS 09800 – Fall Semester – 2008

**Instructor:** Prof. Sam Lehman-Wilzig

**Office:** 163 George St. (Program in Judaic Studies – office of Prof. David Jacobson)

**Office Hours:** Tuesdays & Thursdays 11-12 AM or by appointment (through e-mail)

**Phone:** (Will be announced in class)

**E-mail:** [Sam\\_Lehman-Wilzig@Brown.edu](mailto:Sam_Lehman-Wilzig@Brown.edu)

**Course Website:** (To be announced August 2008)

### **Course Description & Goals**

The purpose of this course is twofold: to show Zionism in all its ideological diversity; to place Zionism in its proper historical perspective as a concept that not only is not "new" from the standpoint of Jewish history but that is also intrinsically connected to the particular political "environment" and the circumstances in which the Jewish people and later the Israeli State found itself.

The course starts with a discussion of the Political Sovereignty concept in Jewish history; historical and theological yearnings for return to the Land of Israel; and 19<sup>th</sup> century nationalism in Europe and its influence on the origins of modern Zionism. The central section of the course will survey and analyze various forms of **Zionism** from the late 19<sup>th</sup> century to the present era: political, cultural, religious, Socialist, Revisionist, etc.; **anti-Zionism** of early Reform Judaism, ultra-Orthodox Jews, and Moslems/Arabs; evolving contemporary types of **post-Zionism** within and outside of Israel.

The course has no prerequisite. It combines political philosophy and political sociology with some history, theology and economics. A short recommended reading list is offered for those without any background in Israel Studies.

### **Course Requirements**

1. Attendance & Participation – The course is based in significant part on class discussion and presentations. Thus, class attendance is mandatory and student class participation will also be taken into account in grading. **10% of final grade**

2. One oral class presentation and subsequent written assignment: Each student is to choose a "partner" in order to participate in a class debate on a course-relevant issue (if you have trouble finding a partner, the lecturer will act as matchmaker). The length of each presentation will be determined at the start of the year, depending on the number of students registered for the course. The subsequent written paper is due two weeks after the particular students' class debate. See below for more detailed instructions. **Oral presentation: 10%**  
**Written assignment: 25%**

3. Two exams – Mid-Semester & Final – The midterm will be a closed book exam: definition of terms; identifying thinkers and their specific ideology; important Zionist milestones; b- the final exam will be open book, i.e. including all the course's readings and class material

(lectures and debates): essay exam/s focusing on analysis, integration and application of the materials.

**Mid-term: 20% of final grade (1:15 hours); Final: 35% of final grade (2:30 hours)**

## **Course Topics & Readings (with due dates)**

### ***Recommended Introductory Reading List for those Without Israel Studies Background:***

Ben Halpern, The Idea of the Jewish State

Dan Horowitz and Moshe Lissak, Origins of the Israeli Polity: Palestine Under the Mandate

Gregory S. Mahler, Politics and Government in Israel: The Maturation of a Modern State

## ***Section 1: Background***

### **Sept. 4 & 9: Introduction – The Heavy Hand of Jewish History**

Ruth Wisse, Jews and Power (NY: Schocken Books, 2007), pp. 3-78.

Benjamin J. Segal, "Next Year in Jerusalem," Returning, the Land of Israel as a Focus in Jewish History, Section III, Chap. 12:

[http://jewishhistory.com/jh.php?id=AdditionalReadings&content=content/segal\\_ch12](http://jewishhistory.com/jh.php?id=AdditionalReadings&content=content/segal_ch12)

Yehuda Halevi, "My Heart is in the East": <http://www.zionism-israel.com/yehudalevi.htm>  
Read the short intro and both poems.

Yael Zerubavel, Recovered Roots: Collective Memory and the Making of Israeli National Tradition (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995), pp. 13-33.

### **Sept. 11, 16: Laying the Groundwork -- Enlightenment, Nationalism, Modern Anti-Semitism**

Howard M. Sachar, A History of Israel: From the Rise of Zionism to Our Time (NY: Knopf, 1976), pp. 3-88.

David Vital, The Origins of Zionism (Oxford: Oxford U Press, 1975), pp. 3-48.

Shlomo Avineri, The Making of Modern Zionism (London: Basic Books, 1981 [hardcover]; New York: Basic Books, 1984 [softcover]), pp. 3-13; 217-227; 198-216.

\*-----\*

## ***Section 2: Zionisms***

### **Sept. 18, 23: First Stirrings -- The Proto-Zionism of Hess, Alkalai/Kalischer; Pinsker**

Gideon Shimoni, The Zionist Ideology (Waltham, MA: Brandeis U Press, 1995), pp. 52-82.

Arthur Hertzberg, ed., The Zionist Idea (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1997 or Atheneum edition, 1959), pp. 103-139.

Avineri, *op. cit.*, pp. 56-87.

Sam Lehman-Wilzig, "Proto-Zionism and its Proto-Herzl: The Philosophy and Efforts of Rabbi Zvi Hirsch Kalischer," Tradition, vol. 16 (1) (1976), pp. 56-76.

### **Online, Oct. 1-12: Herzl, Political Zionism, and Early Cultural Opponents**

**(Note:** Sept. 30, Oct. 9, 14 & 21 are Jewish holidays – Rosh Hashana, Yom Kippur and Sukkot; there will be no classes on these 4 days. Instead, this section's lectures – equivalent to 4 classes – will be placed on the course site and we will conduct one online discussion on a day between Oct. 1 and Oct. 12, to be agreed upon in advance.)

Shimoni, *op. cit.*, pp. 85-103; 104-112, 269-278.  
 Hertzberg, *op. cit.*, pp. 204-245; 249-277.  
 Avineri, *op. cit.*, pp. 88-111; 112-124.

### **Sept. 25; Oct. 7: Socialist Zionisms**

Shimoni, *op. cit.*, pp. 166-235.  
 Hertzberg, *op. cit.*, pp. 353-366; 371-374, 379-383; 389-395; 605-619.

### **Oct. 16, 23: Revisionist Zionism**

Shimoni, *op. cit.*, pp. 236-266.  
 Hertzberg, *op. cit.*, 556-570.  
 Avineri, *op. cit.*, pp. 159-186.  
 Yaacov N. Goldstein, "Labour and Likud: Roots of their Ideological-Political Struggle for Hegemony over Zionism, 1925-35," *Israel Affairs*, 8 (1-2) (2002), pp. 79-90.

### **Oct. 28: Mid-term exam**

(Include readings on Religious Zionisms)

### **Oct. 30, Nov. 4: Religious Zionisms**

S. Zalman Abramov, Perpetual Dilemma: Jewish Religion in the Jewish State (Cranbury, NJ: Association of University Presses, 1976), pp. 62-74.  
 Shimoni, *op. cit.*, pp. 127-165.  
 Hertzberg, *op. cit.*, pp. 399-405; 407-415; 417-431.  
 Aviezer Ravitzky, Messianism, Zionism, and Jewish Religious Radicalism (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996), pp. 10-78.  
 Ami Isseroff, "Christian Zionism": [http://www.zionism-israel.com/dic/Christian\\_Zionism.htm](http://www.zionism-israel.com/dic/Christian_Zionism.htm)  
 This is a highly detailed, comprehensive, but somewhat rambling survey of the topic.  
 Read it all but there is no need to memorize specific theological nuances.

\*-----\*

## **Section 3: Anti-Zionisms**

### **General Readings**

David Hirsh, Anti-Zionism and Antisemitism: Cosmopolitan Reflections, (New Haven: The Yale Initiative for the Interdisciplinary Study of Antisemitism Working Paper Series, 2007) pp. 19-47.  
<http://www.yale.edu/yiisa/workingpaper/hirsh/David%20Hirsh%20YIISA%20Working%20Paper1.pdf>  
 Robert Wistrich, "Anti-Zionism and Anti-Semitism," *Jewish Political Studies Review*, 16 (3-4) (2004):  
<http://www.jcpa.org/JCPA/Templates/ShowPage.asp?DBID=1&LNGID=1&TMID=111&FID=254&PID=0&IID=1064>  
 Shlomo Avineri, "Western Anti-Zionism: The Middle Ground," in Robert Wistrich (ed.), Anti-Zionism and Anti-Semitism in the Contemporary World (NY: New York University Press, 1990), pp. 171-177.

### **Nov. 6: Ultra-Orthodox Anti-Zionism**

S. Zalman Abramov, *op. cit.*, pp. 74-76.

Emile Marmorstein, Heaven at Bay: The Jewish Kulturkampf in the Holy Land (NY: Oxford University Press, 1969), pp. 58-90.

Website: True Torah Jews Against Zionism: <http://www.jewsagainstzionism.com/index.cfm>

Click on the following sections and sub-sections, and read contents: "About Us" (Our Mission); "Zionism" (Zionism and Anti; Zionists Do Not Represent Jews; The History of Zionism and Judaism); "Anti-Semitism" (Nazi Support of Zionism); "Zionism" (The Role of Zionism in the Holocaust)

### **Nov. 11: Arab Anti-Zionism**

Walter Laqueur, The Israel-Arab Reader: A Documentary History of the Middle East Conflict (NY: Bantam Books, updated and expanded version, 1970-71), pp. 94-104 (Doc. 22); 374-379 (National Covenant of the PLO).

Emmanuel Sivan, "Islamic Fundamentalism, Antisemitism and Anti-Zionism," in Robert Wistrich, *op. cit.*, pp. 74-84.

Antony Lerman, "Fictive Anti-Zionism: Third World, Arab and Muslim Variations," in Robert Wistrich, *ibid.*, pp. 121-138.

### **Nov. 13: "Canaanite" Anti-Zionism**

David Ohana, "Zarathustra in Jerusalem: Nietzsche and the 'New Hebrews'," Israel Affairs, 1(3), pp. 38-60.

Boas Evron, Jewish State or Israeli Nation? (Bloomington: Indiana U Press, 1995), chap. 11.

### **Nov. 18: Jewish Diaspora Anti-Zionism**

Hertzberg, *op. cit.*, pp. 441-449; 451-453; 457-463.

Ami Isseroff, "A brief history of Jewish anti-Zionism" (2005): [http://www.zionism-israel.com/his/jewish\\_anti\\_zionism.htm](http://www.zionism-israel.com/his/jewish_anti_zionism.htm)

Ami Isseroff, "Opposition of Reform Judaism to Zionism - A History" (2005): [http://www.zionism-israel.com/his/reform\\_judaism\\_history.htm](http://www.zionism-israel.com/his/reform_judaism_history.htm)

In the above essay, click on these links and read their short material too: [Philadelphia Conference of Nov. 3-6, 1869](#); [Pittsburgh Conference](#); [The Columbus Platform of 1937](#).

\*-----\*

## ***Section 4: Post-Zionisms***

### **Nov. 20: Zionist Post-Zionism**

Shlomo Aronson, "The Post-Zionist Discourse and Critique of Israel: A Traditional Zionist Perspective," Israel Studies, 8 (2003), pp. 105-129.

Meyrav Wurmser, "Post-Zionism and the Sephardi Question", Middle East Quarterly 12(2) (2005): <http://www.meforum.org/article/707>

Yosef Oren, "Post-Zionism and Anti-Zionism in Israeli Literature," in Shlomo Sharan (ed.), Israel and the Post-Zionists (Brighton, England: Sussex Academic Press, 2003), pp. 188-203.

### **Nov. 25: Bi-National Post-Zionism**

Yfaat Weiss, "Central European Ethnonationalism and Zionist Binationalism," Jewish Social Studies, 11 (1) (2004), pp. 93-117.

Edward Said, "Zionism from the Standpoint of Its Victims," Social Text, No. 1 (Winter, 1979), pp. 7-58:

<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0164-2472%28197924%290%3A1%3C7%3AZFTSOI%3E2.0.CO%3B2-K>

Also found in: Moustafa Bayoumi and Andrew Rubin, eds., The Edward Said Reader (New York: Random House Inc., 2000), pp. 114-68.

Ilan Pappé, "Post-Zionist Critique on Israel and the Palestinians: Part I: The Academic Debate", Journal of Palestine Studies, 26 (2) (1997) pp. 29-41.

Abigail Fraser and Avi Shabat, "Between Nationalism and Liberalism: The Political Thought of Azmi Bisharah," Israel Affairs, 9 (1) (2003), pp. 16-36:  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/714003471>

### **Dec. 2, 4: Towards the Future**

Alan Dowty, The Jewish State: A Century Later (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1998), pp. 103-136.

Uri Ram, "The State of the Nation: Contemporary Challenges to Zionism in Israel", Constellations, 6 (3) (1999), pp. 325-338.

Danny Ben-Moshe (2004) "Post-Zionism in the Oslo Era and the Implications for the Diaspora," Israel Affairs, 10 (1), pp. 313-336:  
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13537120412331321481>

"Perspectives on Zionism and Post-Zionism," Israel Studies Forum, 19 (1) (2003), pp. 89-114. Read all three essays: Freedman; Lustick; Herzog.

### **Dec. 9, 11: Additional Debates or Reading Period**

Note: If we succeed in completing all the student debate presentations, this week will be used as a Reading Period towards the exam. If not, the class/es will be devoted to the remaining debates (class attendance mandatory). In any case, there will be no added lecture material during this week.

\*\*\*\*\*

## **Oral Debate and Written Assignment**

Each pair of students (self-matched or through the lecturer's services) must choose a topic (see below) on which they will present a mini-debate to the class. The time allotted to each debate will depend on the number of students in the course. Each student will present in sequence her/his side of the issue and then (in reverse order) a shorter rebuttal. Afterwards, class time will be allotted for other students to question the debaters who must reply on the spot. Finally, we shall conduct a class discussion moderated by the lecturer.

Afterwards, each debating pair has two weeks to write up their arguments and rebuttals (same format as above) and send it to the lecturer **by email attachment (only)**. The written arguments can certainly take into account rebuttal comments, student questions/critiques in class, and further research – so that the paper may be (but not necessarily must be) substantively quite different from the original debate. A maximum of 5 double-spaced pages are allotted to each student for the initial argument and another maximum 2 pages for the written rebuttal points. The lecturer will award at least a 3 point difference in grade between the "winner" and opponent (for both the oral presentation and the written assignment). The "winner" is not the person with the more popular argument but rather the one who does the best job in marshalling evidence, quotes, citations, etc. For the purpose of deciding the "winner", the lecturer will also take into account which side had the more difficult position to defend (this is not relevant in some cases).

The topics for debate can be selected from the following list or any other topic suggested by the debating pair. In either case, "first come, first served" so that the pair should email the topic request as soon as possible but no later than Sept. 28, Sunday, midnight (if it is a topic not on the following list, please add a few lines of explanation). Debate dates for each pair of students will be announced in class on Oct. 2; the class debates will start sometime towards the end of October. The grading of the oral debate will be a bit more lenient for the first three pairs of debaters (due to preparation time pressure).

**Possible topics for the debate & accompanying paper (other topics welcomed):**

Note: These topics are not purely "ideological". Each has a connection to environmental factors – historical, economic, political, etc. Thus, most of these topics will demand of the debating student to read more widely on the specific ideological subject as well as on actual Israeli socio-political reality. These are also not topics for which one can say that there is a clear "correct" answer. The main purpose is not to reach the "truth" but rather to better understand significant non-ideological factors in the development of Anti/Post/Zionist ideology and/or in assessing its success/failure. A good place to start looking for additional material is The Jewish Virtual Library / Zionism:

<http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsourc/zion.html>

- 1) Modern Zionism would have emerged even without the development of European Romantic Nationalism and the role model of new nation states such as Germany and Italy. *Yes/No*
- 2) Had Theodore Herzl been a practicing Orthodox Jew, Zionism and the nascent Jewish State would have developed in a much more traditional and religious fashion. *Yes/No*
- 3) One of the main flaws of early Zionist ideologies (until 1918) was the lack of serious thought given to the local Arabs and their place in the future State of Israel. *True/False*
- 4) From the perspective of 2008, Vladimir Jabotinsky's Zionist writings regarding socio-economic issues look prescient. *True/False*
- 5) From the perspective of 2008, Vladimir Jabotinsky's Zionist writings regarding national security / local Arab population solutions are still quite relevant. *True/False*
- 6) From an intellectual / ideological standpoint, American-Jewish Zionists (who did not move to Palestine) contributed little of significance to the Zionist movement. *True/False*
- 7) Without Eliezer Ben-Yehuda and the revival of Hebrew as a spoken language, Zionism could not have survived for long and Israel could not have come into being. *Agree/Disagree*.
- 8) Almost all Zionist ideologues accepted the idea of "Negation of the Diaspora" (at least until the establishment of the State of Israel). This was a mistake on their part. *Agree/Disagree*.
- 9) Socialist Zionism was a *success/failure*.
- 10) The Greater Israel settler movement was an inevitable outgrowth of Religious Zionist ideology. *True/False*

11) The greatest Zionist thinkers were not very successful Zionist doers; the greatest Zionist doers were not very original Zionist thinkers. *Correct/Incorrect.*

12) Post-Zionism is a result more of Zionism's success than any negation of its underlying principles. *Agree/Disagree.*

13) If Ahad Ha'am were alive today and surveyed the Israeli cultural scene, he would declare that his ideology had *reached fruition / failed miserably.*

14) In the final analysis, Zionist ideological thinkers had far less influence on the course of pre-State Israel's development than the pragmatic doers. *True/False* (Note: This is quite different from topic #11 above).

15) The writings of almost all pre-State Zionist ideologues are deeply patriarchal, and anti-feminist in their perspective. *True/False*

16) Any rejuvenated 21<sup>st</sup> century Zionist ideology will have to make a clear distinction regarding citizens of Israel, between Jewish identity and Israeli identity. *Agree/Disagree*